

Central Bucks Reconsideration Committee Report

Per Board Policy and Administrative Regulation 109.2, the Reconsideration Committee met to discuss a challenged library work. All committee members read the work in its entirety, as well as the policy and administrative regulation prior to reconsideration, as delineated below.

| Role | Read Book in Entirety | Read Policy and AR 109.2 | Read Submitted Challenge Form |
|------------------------|--------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------------|
| Library Coordinator | | | |
| District Administrator | × | ⊠ | |
| Professional Educator | ⊠ | ⊠ | |
| Professional Educator | × | ⊠ | |
| Professional Educator | × | ⊠ | |

Challenged Material:

The Reconsideration Committee reviewed the request for reconsideration of the following library material:

Title: Gender Queer

Author: Maia Kobabe

<u>Summary of Concerns</u>: The 'Request to Reconsider Library Materials' form was not available for review. Administration verbally expressed a concern regarding sexually explicit content.



Literary Merit:

The Reconsideration Committee evaluated the literary merit of the challenged work. The findings regarding the work's literary merit are below:

☑ Literary Awards and Honors:

- 2019 New York Public Library's 50 Best Books for Teens
- 2019 Ignatz Award
- 2020 Alex Award
- 2020 Stonewall Book Award
- 2020 ALA Rainbow Project Book List
- 2020 Best Graphic Novels for Teens List from YALSA
- 2020 Texas Library Association Maverick Graphic Novel Reading List
- 2020 2021 Denver Public Schools Top 100 for High Schools
- 2021 School Library Journal 17 Immersive Graphic Novels for Teens, Summer Reading
- 2021 Garden State Teen Book Awards
- 2021 Chicago Public Schools' Great Graphic Novels List



Literary Merit:

The Reconsideration Committee evaluated the literary merit of the challenged work. The findings regarding the work's literary merit are below:

☑ Professional Literary Reviews:

PopCulture Classroom (April 17, 2019)

Centered on educating everyone (most especially parents, families, librarians, students and teachers, and even higher education professors) Kobabe explains gender and gender identity in the 21st century in both a uniquely personal and an extremely resourceful manner. As an out lesbian who grew up during a different time than Kobabe and faced many similar discriminatory and/or uninformed people and their thoughts on how I expressed my gender identity both personally and professionally, I've struggled for years internalizing all of the names I've been called, employers who have discriminated against me, family who have asked me if I am "now going transgender because that's the new fad," strangers clearly talking about and pointing at me in public, and my most frequent experience: Being pushed out (sometimes gently and sometimes with aggressive force) of women's restrooms all over the world. I guess most people think I don't belong there. But I do belong there.

In fact, Kobabe, myself, and every single person on this planet each deserve the same rights to live lives full of happiness and peace, and more importantly, on the respective terms we individually feel best express who we are both inside and outside.

By tracing eir own childhood, teenage, college, grad school, and career experiences with gender identity, Kobabe presents a vulnerable and informative look at emself and society. Sharing eir literary explorations on gender identity throughout eir life, Kobabe actually ends up generously offering eir readers a resource list focused on how to understand gender identity in the 21st century.

Note: Be sure to keep a notebook nearby as you read because Kobabe's resources will inspire you to take notes as well.

Here's a sneak peak of one of the most critical points Kobabe teaches readers of *Gender Queer*: After literally spending eir childhood years and into eir adulthood self-reflecting and studying gender identity and how e fits within gender studies Kobabe explains why e has chosen the pronouns that e best identifies with: e, em, and eir.

The most personal autobiography I've ever read, Kobabe gracefully and honestly tackles some of the toughest topics regarding gender and self-identity, giving educators a literary autobiography that will surely help every human being (both living now and for generations to come) better understand how gender identity and self-discovery are key to healing some of the angst and hurt that have come from countless years of misunderstandings.



Literary Merit:

The Reconsideration Committee evaluated the literary merit of the challenged work. The findings regarding the work's literary merit are below:

☑ Professional Literary Reviews:

Publisher's Weekly

This heartfelt graphic memoir relates, with sometimes painful honesty, the experience of growing up non-gender-conforming. From a very young age, Kobabe is unsure whether to claim a lesbian/gay, bisexual, or even transgender identity: "I don't want to be a girl. I don't want to be a boy either. I just want to be myself." Kobabe comes of age having to navigate expressions of identity such as clothing and haircuts, with fraught attempts at romantic and sexual entanglements. Eventually, Kobabe's supportive sister concludes: "I think you're a genderless person." (Kobabe: "She knew before I did.") Kobabe continues to explore the challenges of a nonbinary identity, including the use of alternate pronouns (in Kobabe's case, e/em/eir), the trauma of cervical exams, refuting misplaced concerns from a loving relative who believes "female to male" transgenderism could be rooted in a form of misogyny, and learning that the term autoandrophilia actually applies "for me." Intermixed are lighthearted episodes relating Kobabe's devotion to LGBTQ-inspired Lord of the Rings fan fiction and hero worship of flamboyant iceskating champion Johnny Weir. Kobabe is a straightforward cartoonist who uses the medium skillfully (if not particularly stylishly), incorporating ample cheery colors, with a script that's refreshingly smooth and nondidactic for the topic. This entertaining memoir-as-guide holds crossover appeal for mature teens (with a note there's some sexually explicit content) and is sure to spark valuable discussions at home and in classrooms.



Policy and Administrative Regulation 109.2

In accordance with Policy 109.2, the reconsideration committee evaluated whether any excepts within the work included prohibited content, as delineated by the policy.

| ☐ Elementary School Library Materials: N/A |
|--|
| Do any excerpts contain visual or visually implied depictions of sexual acts or simulations of such acts? ☐ Yes ☐ No |
| Do any excerpts contain explicit or implied written descriptions of sexual acts? ☐ Yes ☐ No |
| Do any excerpts contain visual depictions of nudity or implied nudity? ☐ Yes ☐ No |
| ☐ <u>Middle School Library Materials</u> : N/A |
| Do any excerpts contain visual or visually implied depictions of sexual acts or simulations of such acts? ☐ Yes ☐ No |
| Do any excerpts contain explicit written descriptions of sexual acts? ☐ Yes ☐ No |
| Do any excerpts contain visual depictions of nudity - not including materials with diagrams about anatomy for science or content relating to classical works of art? ☐ Yes ☐ No |
| ☑ <u>High School Library Materials</u> : |
| Do any excerpts contain visual or visually implied depictions of sexual acts or simulations of such acts? ⊠ Yes □ No |
| Do any excerpts contain explicit written descriptions of sexual acts? ∑ Yes ☐ No |



Reconsideration Committee Decision:

Based on the reconsideration of the literary work as outlined in this report, the Reconsideration Committee has rendered the following decision:

| ☑ Reconsideration Outcome: | |
|---|--|
| ☐ The literary work will remain on the library shelves and no change to its inclusion in any library will be made. | |
| ☐ The literary work will be moved to another level (elementary, midd or high school) as checked below: | |
| ☐ Elementary School | |
| ☐ Middle School | |
| ☐ High School | |
| □ The literary work will be removed from all school libraries in the Central Bucks School District. Per Policy 109.2, a book of the same genre will be purchased for the collection as a result of the removal of this literary work. | |
| ☑ Reconsideration Vote: | |
| ⋈ All members of the Reconsideration Committee contributed input pertaining to the reconsideration of the literary work in this report. | |
| ☑ All members of the Reconsideration Committee voted on the outcome of the decision based on the findings of the report. The decision is unanimous. | |